

ASSOCIATED PROPERTY TYPES

The scope of this survey is to identify properties associated with the Asian American heritage of Phoenix. Archival research and discussions with members of the Asian American community indicated that there were four distinct ethnic groups that had a presence in Phoenix before 1960: Chinese, Japanese, Filipino, and Asian Indian. Each of these communities had their own historical experiences and economic activities that influenced their settlement, either in particular geographic areas or in sites dispersed throughout the area that is currently within Phoenix city limits.

The historic context for this study, *Asian Americans in Phoenix, 1870-1960*, traces the commercial, agricultural, residential development of these communities, as well as their social and religious activities. From this historical overview, it is evident that there are certain property types that are most representative of the histories of these communities. While some of the most characteristic property types, such as the Phoenix Chinatown and the Japanese truck farms and flower gardens, have been lost in the ongoing development and growth of the city, there are other key types of resources still present.

Through archival research, oral histories, and communications with community members, the project team was able to identify 547 properties that were known to have been associated with one or more of the Asian American groups at one time. Many of these were buildings in Chinatown, farms, or other properties that have been lost due to urban development. In addition, a few of these were found to be outside of Phoenix city limits, or constructed after 1960.

While most of these properties no longer exist, the comprehensive analysis of the geographic distribution of the four Asian American communities as they once were provides detailed information on the associated property types that might be found (see Table 6). Subsequently, the field survey confirmed that 117 of these properties still exist in the City of Phoenix (see Table 7).

Properties were evaluated to determine their eligibility for listing in the Phoenix Historic Property Register, which has the same standards and criteria as the National Register of Historic Places. Applying the National Register criteria, an eligible property must have significance, i.e., historical, cultural, archaeological, architectural, or engineering importance; it must retain enough of its integrity to convey its significance; and it must be at least fifty years old, or have attained its significance at least fifty years ago. For this survey, the area of significance is Ethnic Heritage: Asian American, and the period of significance is 1870-1960. Properties were evaluated in a local context for their significance to Phoenix history.

Table 6 – Known Properties Associated with the Four Asian American Communities in Phoenix, 1870-1960	
Chinese - American 371 properties	? 5 agricultural ? 180 commercial - grocery ? 42 commercial - other than grocery ? 117 residential ? 29 other types - church, family association, organization, rock art
Japanese - American 95 properties	? 55 agricultural ? 15 commercial ? 16 residential ? 9 other types
Filipino – American 61 properties	? 2 agricultural ? 5 commercial ? 54 residential
Asian Indian – American 13 properties	? 5 agricultural ? 1 commercial ? 7 residential
Associated with more than one group 5 properties	? 3 Chinese/Japanese (commercial, institutional) ? 2 Japanese/Filipino (commercial)
Note: identification of these 547 properties included some that were known to no longer exist, and some that were likely to have attained significance after 1960.	

Table 7 – Currently Existing Properties Associated with the Four Asian American Communities in Phoenix, 1870-1960	
Chinese - American 93 properties	? 1 agricultural ? 61 commercial - grocery ? 7 commercial - restaurant ? 2 commercial - produce warehouse ? 19 residential ? 3 other type - church, organization, folk art site
Japanese - American 5 properties	? 1 agricultural ? 1 commercial - flower shop ? 1 residential ? 2 other type – church
Filipino - American 17 properties	? 17 residential
Asian Indian - American 2 properties	? 2 agricultural
Note: these 117 properties were identified in the field survey only as existing without full evaluation of their significance, integrity, and age.	

Significance may be established by association with notable events or broad patterns of history (Criterion A), association with an important person (Criterion B), distinctive characteristics of design or construction (Criterion C), or potential

to yield information important in prehistory or history (Criterion D). For this survey, architectural significance (Criterion C) was not evaluated as it is outside of the defined scope of the project; however, some properties that were previously surveyed for their architectural significance were revisited to amend their statement of significance to include their association with this historic context. In general, properties that are associated with the context *Asian Americans in Phoenix, 1870-1960* will be significant for their importance to the broad patterns of history (Criterion A) or their relationship to an important person in the Asian American community (Criterion B),

Integrity refers to the physical characteristics of a property that allow it to show its significance. To be considered an eligible property, a structure must retain its basic form and character-defining features to the degree that it still provides a true and authentic representation of its historic appearance. According to National Register criteria, evaluation of integrity requires analysis of seven key qualities: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. All buildings undergo change over time, so it is not essential that all seven attributes have been preserved intact, but an eligible property must still convey a sense of the time during which it attained its significance.

Location is an important component of a building's integrity. Structures that have been moved from their original location are usually not eligible for listing on the City or National registers. In Phoenix, certain places -- Chinatown, Salt River, the north slope of South Mountain, the intersection of 43rd Avenue and Indian School Road -- have been important focal points for the Asian American communities, and individual resources often have a spatial relationship to these centers. Conversely, the ubiquitous Chinese groceries, which were scattered throughout the city, were oriented more to the particular neighborhoods that they served, and through time they have become landmarks in the local streetscape. Generally, a structure that has been moved from its original location would be considered ineligible unless extraordinary significance would justify an exception.

Design refers primarily to architecture, the form, plan, and structure that determines the appearance of a building. An eligible property should still possess important elements of its original design, such as roof type, fenestration, and decorative elements. Decorative features or design elements based specifically on Asian cultural motifs are very rare, so their presence would be a particularly important factor. Over time, remodeling, repairs, or construction of additions can drastically change the essential form and appearance of a structure. To an extent, this is understood to be part of the natural evolution of a building as it is adapted to changing needs. Modifications made during the period of significance are usually considered a vital part of a building's history; if modifications were made after the period of significance, and sensitive to the original design, a

building may still retain enough of its character-defining elements to show its significance.

Setting is the relationship of a property to its surrounding environment and its place in the broader streetscape. Redevelopment and infill construction, commercial or industrial encroachment into residential neighborhoods, widening of streets, construction of freeways, and proximity of poorly maintained properties and vacant buildings can all adversely impact integrity of setting.

Material is closely related to design; it refers to the original fabric and texture of a structure, evident in its walls and surfaces. The original materials of a building should be preserved and visible to the greatest extent possible; new materials used for repairs and maintenance should be similar to those that were used in the original construction. The loss of original materials is most evident in walls where brick masonry has been painted, stucco plaster has been applied over brick or concrete block, or metal or artificial siding materials have been mounted over exterior walls. Such applications are usually irreversible but do not necessarily make a property ineligible.

Workmanship is evidence of work of a skilled craftsman or artist represented in a structure. Such attributes are uncommon in twentieth century construction in Phoenix, but their presence would be an important factor in evaluating a building, particularly if they reflected an Asian cultural tradition.

Feeling is a quality of a building that continues to visually represent its historic form, function, and use. Evaluation should determine whether a resource can still be recognized as being the same structure that existed during the period of its significance, and whether it still looks like the same type of building, e.g., a grocery. The integrity of feeling associated with a building is particularly strong when the current use of a property is the same or similar to its historic use.

Association is the relationship of a property to the historic context under which it is being evaluated. An eligible property will have a specific tangible link to the people, events, or activities outlined in the historical narrative. A property's association with Asian Americans must be strong and direct, and not incidental or short term, i.e., it must have been built, owned, occupied, or used by Asian Americans for an adequate period of time, generally at least twenty years. A property which was associated with Asian Americans for less than twenty years would be considered ineligible unless a particularly important relationship could be demonstrated. For the purposes of this survey, association is one of the most important attributes in determining the integrity of a property.

The following discussion focuses on the primary associated property types and the registration requirements used to evaluate each type. In general, evaluation

of a property is based on a study of the primary façade, which should retain most of the essential physical features that made up its character or appearance during the period of significance, and on its association to the historic context *Asian Americans in Phoenix, 1870-1960*.

COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES

By far, the most common commercial property type associated with Asian Americans is the grocery. While there were a few Japanese grocers, this property type is almost exclusively associated with the Chinese American community, a phenomenon unintentionally created by the terms of the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882. In the early 1950s, there were more than two hundred Chinese groceries in Phoenix; today, less than a quarter of these structures remain, but of those that do, most continue to be operated as neighborhood groceries.

The typical Chinese grocery was actually a mixed-use commercial-residential property; the grocer and his family lived in an apartment in the rear part of the store, or in a house in back of the grocery, on the same parcel, or to the side on an adjacent lot. These small, independent groceries were generally located within or adjacent to a residential neighborhood, usually on a corner lot or on a main street that borders a neighborhood. By 1950, they were well-dispersed throughout the city, from south of the Salt River to North of Camelback Road, between 40th Street and 35th Avenue.

The design of groceries was fairly standard: small, freestanding, one-story, 20th Century Commercial style structures with a broad façade facing the street. Common features include high parapet, cantilevered canopy extending across the full width of the façade, central or offset entry, and various arrangements of display windows, with few decorative elements. A slightly different design seen in several groceries has square box-like massing and a corner entry with a small canopy, or no canopy. Wall materials included brick, concrete block, and stucco.

A variety of signage types are used to identify the businesses, from painted lettering or three-dimensional lettering on the parapet to simple vinyl or paper banners mounted on a wall. A freestanding sign or large lighted displays are very rare. Only one type of Asian-inspired decorative feature has been noted -- a uniquely shaped parapet vaguely reminiscent of the curved upturned eaves of a Chinese bell tower. This element is very rare.

Another notable characteristic of these groceries is their placement at or near the front of the lot with little setback from the street. This is possibly due to the necessity of placing a residence at the back of the lot. As a result, there is often

limited off-street parking, but this was apparently not an important factor for the neighborhood grocery because many customers simply walked to the store.

There does not appear to be any consistent correlation between occupation, ownership, and design of these groceries. Chinese Americans were known to lease stores, buy existing buildings, or buy lots and build their own stores. However, the consistency of design suggests that the physical attributes of this property type are associated more with neighborhood grocery than Chinese grocery, and the Chinese character of the properties is due to the fact that Chinese Americans were dominant in the operation of neighborhood groceries in Phoenix.

Most of the remaining Chinese groceries have been altered in various ways since their construction. The most common changes are in the fenestration patterns of the façade. Large display windows are often filled completely or partially and replaced with smaller windows. Additionally, doors and windows may be covered with metal grills, bars, or other visible security features. Another often seen modification is the resurfacing of exterior walls, usually with stucco plaster applied over brick or concrete block. These types of modifications should not necessarily render a property ineligible because they are made largely as a result of a property's continued use as a neighborhood grocery, despite increasing crime rates in some older neighborhoods. Such adaptations offer a degree of protection from burglary, graffiti, and other forms of vandalism, as well as providing additional wall space needed for modern merchandising displays. A few of the extant groceries expanded their buildings, with structures constructed adjacent to the original, and the interior wall removed to provide wide access. Façades were modified to simulate the original appearance, while consolidating the addition.

While some impact on design and materials may be expected, an eligible grocery should not have been altered to such degree that its historic form and character is no longer evident. It should have strong integrity of location, setting, feeling and association. It is worth noting that most of these structures still function as neighborhood groceries or similar types of retail businesses, and many are now owned and/or operated by recent Asian immigrants from such countries as China, Korean, Vietnam, India, and Pakistan. Some continue to use their historic business name, even after changes in ownership. If a grocer's house was originally associated with a grocery, its loss would not automatically render the grocery ineligible, but its presence would increase the significance. Because of the importance of this property type, evaluation should take into consideration the age and strength of association of the resource.

Another important commercial property type is produce warehouse. The wholesale produce business was an integral part of the economic development

of all communities. As most Asian Americans worked either on truck farms or in groceries, they were both sellers and buyers of fresh produce. By its very nature, a produce warehouse is generally located adjacent to a rail line. An eligible property of this type would exhibit integrity of design and materials to the degree necessary to convey its identity as a warehouse, and its historic ownership and/or operation should be directly associated with Asian American individuals.

Restaurant is the third major commercial property type representative of the business opportunities that were available to Asian Americans in Phoenix. Two particular restaurants, the American Kitchen and Toy's Shangri-La, were large well-established businesses that gained prominence in the larger community, but they were exceptions; most Asian American restaurants were considerably smaller. The earliest restaurants owned and/or operated by Asian Americans offered typical American fare; it was not until after World War II that these businesses started featuring Asian cuisines on their menus.

Restaurants, more than other property types, tend to exhibit specialized and unique attributes. Particularly after World War II, a restaurant's function, menu and trademark identity were strongly represented in the building's design, decorative features, and signage. If a structure was later converted to a use other than a restaurant, or if it continued to function as a restaurant but with a different name and menu, it was typically remodeled to remove vestiges of its previous identity. Consequently, an eligible property must possess a high level of integrity of feeling and association. It must retain enough of its character defining features to convey its function as a restaurant and its unique historical identity.

There were other specific commercial property types associated with Asian Americans, such as produce stand, flower shop, laundry, pool hall, and garage, but no examples of these type that date to the period of significance are known to still exist.

RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES

Specific types of individual single-family houses may be potentially eligible under Criterion A for their association with the types of economic activities or settlement patterns in which Asian Americans were involved. A grocer's house, as previously mentioned, was typically located in back of or adjacent to a grocery. To be considered an eligible property, a grocer's house must not only retain its basic historic appearance, but the grocery with which it was associated must still exist and retain its integrity.

Considering the importance of agriculture to all Asian American groups, a farmhouse is a particularly significant and rare type of resource. With the few surviving examples of this property type, there has often been loss of agricultural

lands, related outbuildings, irrigation works (wells, pumps, canals, headgates, turnouts), and watch houses. Ideally, a property of this type should still possess some of these functional elements of a farm, but minimally, it must retain a sufficiently large lot and open space to be able to convey a sense of its original rural agricultural setting.

An individual single-family house may be potentially eligible under Criterion B if it is directly associated with a person who was important to the Asian American community during the period in which he or she attained importance. An eligible property must retain enough of its historic appearance -- i.e., integrity of design, setting, materials, and feeling -- from the period of its significance.

OTHER PROPERTY TYPES

Additional property types may also qualify based on age, significance, and other factors. If extant, churches, schools, family association and benevolent society buildings, and folk art sites all may be eligible if they meet the requirements for Criterion A.

EVALUATION

During the course of the field survey, 117 existing properties were identified. Listed below is a summary of recommendations regarding these properties based on evaluation according to the registration requirements:

? Previously listed on the Phoenix Register/National Register	5/6
? Potentially eligible as individual properties	11
	19
? Not eligible due to significance	25
? Not eligible due to integrity	69
? Not eligible due to age	4
	98

Table 8 provides additional analysis of the nineteen properties that are listed or recommended as eligible, broken down by cultural affiliation and property type.

Table 8 - Listed or Potentially Eligible Properties Associated with Asian Americans in Phoenix, 1870-1960	
Chinese - American 16 properties	? 10 commercial – grocery ? 2 commercial - produce warehouse ? 1 residential ? 1 residential - farm house ? 1 other type - church ? 1 other type - folk art site
Japanese - American 1 property	? 1 residential - farm house
Filipino - American 1 properties	? 1 residential
Asian Indian - American 1 properties	? 1 residential - farm house

Table 9 - Inventory List: Listed or Eligible Properties								
Phoenix Historic Property Register/National Registry of Historic Places Eligibility								
E - Individually Eligible LP - Listed Individually on Phoenix Register LN - Listed Individually on National Register CP - Listed as Contributor on Phoenix Register CN - Listed as Contributor on National Register								
Inv#	Property Name	Address	Year Built	E	LP	LN	CP	CN
1	Ah Gim Yaun Grocery	1002 South 4 th Avenue	1920/1925	X		X		
2	D. H. Toy Residence	2222 East Pasadena Avenue	1951	X				
3	First Chinese Baptist Church	122 East Culver Street	1922	X	X			

4	Henry and Co.	1346 West Roosevelt Street	1928	X				
5	Jim Ong's Market	1110 East Washington Street	1928	X	X	X		
6	K. L. Tang Grocery	1141 East Buckeye Road	1942	X				
7	K. S. Tang Grocery / Superior Market	901 Northwest Grand Avenue	1914	X		X	X	X
8	Kunz-Carbajal Residence	1721 South 7 th Avenue	1904	X	X			
9	Lee's Oriental Rock Garden	4015 East McDonald Drive	1958	X				
10	Modern Food Market	1737 East Washington Street	1948	X				
11	Nakagawa Residence (demolished)	4001 East Baseline Road	1930	X				
12	New Deal Market / O. D. Market	1003 East Sheridan Road	1928	X			X	X
13	Ong Farm	410 North 59 th Avenue	1930	X				
14	Ong Yut Geong Wholesale Market	121 East Buchanan Street	1926/1928	X	X	X		
15	Roland's Market	1505 East Van Buren Street	1917	X				
16	Singh Farm	3831 South 12 th Street	1930	X				
17	South Phoenix Market	4314 South Central Avenue	1948	X				
18	Sun Mercantile Co. Warehouse	230 South 3 rd Street	1929	X	X	X		
19	T and T Market	2145 East Van Buren Street	1939	X				

Property Name	Address	Cultural Affiliation
Albert and Carmen Singh Farm House	3839 South 12 th Street	Asian Indian
C. S. Ong Residence	3019 East McKinley Street	Chinese
Cathay Garden	1320 North Central Avenue	Chinese
Cerilo D. and Lupe Legozo Residence	610 West Apache Street	Filipino
Cesario and Jennie Dawa Residence	520 West Apache Street	Filipino
Chin's Food Market (Chin)	1407 East Van Buren Street	Chinese
Ding Ho Inn	3625 North Central Avenue	Chinese
Dr. Edward Wong, MD, Residence	316 West Roosevelt Street	Chinese
Ernest Y. W. Dong Residence	1326 East Diamond Street	Chinese
Eugene and Francisca Principe Residence	823 South 5 th Avenue	Filipino
Frank and Lien Chow Residence	2413 West Monroe Street	Chinese
Fred M. Dong Residence	314 West Yavapai Street	Chinese
Henry Fong Residence	6630 South Montezuma Street	Chinese
Hom G. Ting Residence	1150 East Indian School Road	Chinese
Howard Wal Grocery	1144 East Indian School Road	Chinese
Howard's Market	924 East Roosevelt Street	Chinese

James Dong Residence	2046 West Sherman Street	Chinese
Jew Chee Residence	11 East Tonto Street	Chinese
Jew Lee Residence	2300 East Culver Street	Chinese
John Lamar/L. P. Magday Residence	602 West Apache Street	Filipino
John's Superette (Blue Moon)	2911 East Van Buren Street	Chinese
Roy W. Marr Residence	1022 East Mohave Street	Chinese
Sing Yee Jr. Grocery	2044 East Yale Street	Chinese
Tom Ting Residence	630 North 30 th Place	Chinese
W. W. Jones House	1008 East Buckeye Road	Filipino

<u>Property Name</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Cultural Affiliation</u>
(Chinese Clubhouse)	415 South 1 st Street	Chinese
A. K. Bacud Residence	609 West Mohave Street	Filipino
Ah Gee Grocery	1437 East Van Buren Street	Chinese
Bucap Residence	605 West Mohave Street	Filipino
Canyon State Market	902 North 24 th Street	Chinese
Central Market	903 North 16 th Street	Chinese
D. H. Toy House (I)	Southwest corner of 16 th Street and Camelback Road	Chinese
Dan's Food Market (Yee)	3505 East Thomas Road	Chinese
Doug Lee's Asia House	2310 East McDowell Road	Chinese
Empire Market	1223 West Buckeye Road	Chinese
Eugene and Francisca Principe Residence	1131 West Grant Street	Filipino
Everybody Grocery/Farmer's Super Market	6736 North 19 th Avenue	Chinese
Farinas House	617 West Mohave Street	Filipino
Gakachi H and Kamada Kobashigawa Residence	2201 East Indian School Road	Japanese
Galo Residence	1430 South 8 th Avenue	Filipino
George Wing Grocery	1126 South 4 th Avenue	Chinese
Golden Gate Grocery/Ben Brothers Market	1645 East Van Buren Street	Chinese
H and W Market	2145 West Jefferson Street	Chinese
Harry Tang Grocery/Dinner Bell Market	1250 West Buckeye Road	Chinese
Henry and Jack N. Yee Residence	2137 West Adams Street	Chinese
Hyde Park Market	101 North 27 th Avenue	Chinese
J. S. Gonzaga House	358 West Apache Street	Filipino
Jack's Grocery/Star Market	2101 West Adams Street	Chinese
James Wong Grocery/Hing Hong Grocery	1001 South 3 rd Street	Chinese
John S. Ngan Residence	3014 North 27 th Street	Chinese
John's Rancho Market	4441 South 15 th Avenue	Chinese
Kay's Market	1345 West Grant Street	Chinese

Table 11 - Continued

Keystone Market	3503 North 7 th Street	Chinese
King's Food Market/King's Pharmacy	2104 West Camelback Road	Chinese
L. J. Suk Grocery	1425 North 14 th Street	Chinese
Lee Jew Market	1501 East Washington Street	Chinese
Lung Yuen Market	808 East Washington Street	Chinese
Margarito Aleto House	906 West Mohave Street	Filipino
Mountain View Food Market	2337 East Indian School Road	Chinese
Market Center	516 North 35 th Avenue	Chinese
Martin's Market	1801 East Washington Street	Chinese
New Garden Restaurant	823 South Central Avenue	Chinese
New Moon Market/Minute Liquors	2355 South 16 th Street	Chinese
New Nanking Restaurant	1618 North 16 th Street	Chinese
New Town Market	1602 South 7 th Avenue	Chinese
New Village Market	1201 South 1 st Avenue	Chinese
Pete Borruga Residence	714 West Mohave Street	Filipino
Primitivo Vioria House	1628 South 5 th Street	Filipino
Purity Food Market	3205 East Washington Street	Chinese
Robert's Market	2002 East Madison Street	Chinese
S. H. Ong Grocery	1209 South 1 st Avenue	Chinese
Sam Kee Grocery	1101 West Grant Street	Chinese
Sam Kim Grocery/Fay's Market	1702 South 7 th Avenue	Chinese
Sleung Yee Grocery	724 South Central Avenue	Chinese
Soon's Market	5201 South 15 th Avenue	Chinese
Sun Valley Market	2445 West Washington Street	Chinese
T. D. Yuen Grocery	1869 East Van Buren Street	Chinese
Tang Shing Residence	1801 East McDowell Road	Chinese
Temporado House	3631 South 17 th Street	Filipino
Tip Top Market/Westward Market	2930 West Buckeye Road	Chinese
Toy's Shangri La Restaurant	1575 East Camelback Road	Chinese
Toy's Grocery	4846 North 16 th Street	Chinese
Village Market	3401 North 32 nd Street	
William H. Wong Residence	1708 West Van Buren Street	Chinese
William Tang Grocery/East Washington Market	2345 East Washington Street	Chinese
Williams Food Market	1716 West Van Buren Street	Chinese
Wing F. Ong Grocery & Law Office	1246 East Jefferson Street	Chinese
Wing's Restaurant/Ong Law Office	1617 East Thomas Road	Chinese
Wing's Grocery	417 West Sherman Street	Chinese
Wong's Market	1501 West Hadley Street	Chinese
WY Market	1819 West Buckeye Road	Chinese
Yabo Residence	1707 South 7 th Avenue	Chinese
Yee Quinn Residence	2232 East Culver Street	Chinese
Ying Ong Grocery	1001 East Roosevelt Street	Chinese

Table 12 - Inventory List: Properties Not Eligible Due to Age		
<u>Property Name</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Cultural Affiliation</u>
Arizona Buddhist Temple	4142 West Clarendon Avenue	Japanese
Baseline Flower Growers	3801 East Baseline Road	Japanese
Japanese Free Methodist Church	4143 North 43 rd Avenue	Japanese
Watanabe Flower Garden	1031 West Baseline Road	Japanese